

A Comparison of *Winning for Working Families,* A Proposal by the AFL-CIO Officers with *Restoring the American Dream,* A Proposal by Four Unions

The attached chart provides a detailed comparison between the substantive proposals made by the AFL-CIO executive officers on April 28 (and updated on June 7), following extensive efforts to gather input from unions and others, and the May 16 proposals by a group of four unions. The chart relies on the language of the proposals themselves to make the comparisons.

Although the frameworks for the two proposals differ somewhat—the four unions address the role of the AFL-CIO more broadly while the AFL-CIO officers focus on major proposals for change—some conclusions can be drawn:

- The proposals are more alike than different in their goals and principles for major programmatic areas;
- Important distinctions emerge in the areas of rebuilding state and local capacity and in organizing;

The AFL-CIO officers outline a plan for strengthening state federations and central labor councils that has been adopted by the Executive Council;

The four unions' proposal is silent on rebuilding state and local capacity;

The AFL-CIO officers' proposal creates a strategic organizing fund that includes rebates as incentives to unions that have met high standards for organizing as well as a fund for strategic campaigns aimed at corporations such as Wal-Mart; it also calls for continued top-level assistance to national unions that are building strategic capacity for organizing and to train senior and lead organizers;

The four unions' proposal does not treat organizing as a core function of the AFL-CIO but rather rebates per capita taxes to unions that have a plan for strategic organizing and devotes \$25 million to creating a strategic center to run multiunion campaigns aimed at Wal-Mart and other global corporations;

- Both proposals call for building industry strength, but in slightly different ways, and both proposals call for changes in rules covering organizing and bargaining standards in order to build power within areas, industries and sectors.

The proposals, then, are substantially similar. The AFL-CIO officers are committed to continuing to listen and debate these differences. The inevitable question that arises is this: Are these narrowing differences grounds for leaving and splitting the labor movement?

CORE FUNCTIONS OF THE AFL-CIO

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Capital strategies/ stewardship	✓	✓
Global solidarity	✓	✓
Legal action	(legal initiatives will be maintained)	✓
Legislative action (incl. health care, retirement security)	✓	✓
Organizing support	✓	(merger incentives only)
Political action	✓	✓
Public communication	✓	✓
Strengthen state/ local capacity	✓	

ORGANIZING

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Principles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Unions must make major investments in strategic organizing to increase membership ■ AFL-CIO must reorder efforts to provide greatest incentives, coordination, support to multiply strategic organizing, create ways for unions to work cooperatively for consolidated strength in key industries 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ AFL-CIO must stimulate, focus on union organizing to bring workers together along industry/occupational lines ■ Workers identify with each other according to industry/occupation ■ Economic action becomes stronger as percentage of union members in industry/occupation increases
Amount of AFL-CIO funds available to affiliates as rebates	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Will create \$22.5 million Strategic Organizing Fund (\$10 million increase over current fund) ■ Will rebate \$15 million from fund back to unions that meet high standards in changing to organize 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ AFL-CIO should rebate half of per capita tax it receives from unions back to those unions that have strategic plan and commitment to organizing in their core industries (with variation for craft/project-based industries)

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Standards for rebates	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Organizing Committee and Executive Committee to establish standards (starting from Sweeney proposal of March 2005: must have strategic organizing program focused on core industries; also dedicate 30% of annual revenue, commit adequate staff and volunteers; incorporate Voice@Work component) ■ Panel of retired union presidents will review applications for rebates 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Not discussed (references proposal to give rebates to unions that spend it on strategic plan for organizing in key industries and spend 10% of their per capita taxes or \$2 million—whichever is larger—on organizing; Executive Council would evaluate strategic plan; rebate decision would be evaluated every two years)
Strategic campaigns	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ \$7.5 million from fund will assist affiliates' strategic organizing campaigns of importance to entire labor movement (e.g., Wal-Mart, Comcast, FedEx, Toyota, major public employer) ■ Conduct major global campaign to expose Wal-Mart, hold it accountable and mobilize federationwide support for UFCW's drive to protect against Wal-Martization of good jobs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Create strategic center within AFL-CIO, using \$25 million from current AFL-CIO funds, to finance large, multiunion campaigns against Wal-Mart and other global low-road corporations
Additional organizing assistance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Continue to provide top-level assistance to national unions to build strategic programs, train senior/ lead organizers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Does not discuss
Build industry strength	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Create Industry Coordinating Committees (ICCs) ■ Require participation in each ICC by affiliates in that sector ■ ICCs would: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. develop, implement global industry strategies to support organizing, bargaining 2. create joint strategic growth plans, establish joint bargaining programs, joint political/legislative programs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ AFL-CIO must coordinate labor's efforts to build bargaining strength by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. identifying lead unions by sector, industry, etc., and their responsibilities 2. facilitating coordinated bargaining, with penalties for affiliates that undercut standards 3. establishing, enforcing standards in such areas as bargaining, strategic industry plans/results, workplace organization

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
AFL-CIO dispute process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Revise Article XX/XXI of AFL-CIO Constitution to reinforce work of ICCs, promote cooperative organizing, encourage strategic organizing in industry, sector, employer where union has significant/dominant presence ■ Ensure Article XX process does not undermine integrity of representation and pursuit of strongest possible contract standards ■ Expand, modify Strategic Campaign Registration Program to encourage unions to register more campaigns 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Industry/area bargaining standards must become central to interunion dispute process and labor's efforts to focus resources on building power ■ Rules must be updated, revised to <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. reflect need to deter "race to the bottom" when employers use one union as protection from another 2. encourage unions to devote resources to building power in core industries and coordinate bargaining
Mergers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ AFL-CIO will encourage and actively facilitate voluntary mergers, especially between unions with common core jurisdictions, that will increase bargaining power 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ AFL-CIO should develop proactive, industry-based merger policy (incl. incentives) and play active, direct role to facilitate mergers—subject to approval by membership—that lead to increased power for workers in same/complimentary industries
Protecting workers' freedom to form unions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ AFL-CIO will expand Voice@Work campaign to strengthen workers' right to organize, curtail employer interference by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. building public, community support, changing laws 2. growing volunteers by training 100,000 worksite stewards by 2008 3. expanding effort to educate elected officials, opinion leaders; gaining their support for collective bargaining and Employee Free Choice Act 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Political priority must be to promote, protect workers' right to have a voice on the job ■ Highest priority at local, state, national levels should be encouraging public officials to actively support workers trying to form unions and support maintenance, growth of union jobs ■ Public officials' track record on these issues should determine union members' support
Global solidarity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Build on global reach of AFL-CIO Solidarity Center to increase support for connecting workers' struggles in other countries with affiliate organizing and bargaining campaigns in the United States involving multinational employers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Expand AFL-CIO's international orientation toward global campaigns against anti-union employers as means to building worker power

POLITICS

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Principles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Organizing/growth and politics are linked: We cannot win policy/political contests without growth; we cannot grow as fast as needed unless we transform laws and win progressive political environment ■ Must create permanent culture of activism, rooted in communities, relying heavily on state and local labor movements, to win good jobs and other advances for working people, including health care and retirement security 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Nation's political course cannot change fundamentally unless union density increases ■ Increased political spending without a program for growth will not lead to increased power for workers in workplace or in politics ■ Political action is part of AFL-CIO's primary responsibilities ■ Tradeoff between spending on politics and organizing is not required; AFL-CIO can increase resources for both by cutting bureaucracy, eliminating functions that should be done by affiliates
Worker mobilization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Must build year-round capacity for informing, mobilizing union members (including Working America) around legislative and policy issues and for political action by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. integrating legislative fights with political mobilization; expanding work with community allies 2. identifying tens of thousands of local union coordinators to lead worksite education, mobilization 3. placing full-time campaign directors in key states; creating mobilization capacity in every state 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Labor's political program must be meaningful, relevant to union and nonunion workers ■ Labor's political program must be workplace-centered, worker-oriented, independent of any party or candidate
Substantive priorities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Develop new political relationships by building bridges across party lines to win bipartisan support ■ Develop, implement long-term plan to create worker-friendly governing majorities by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. taking message about working families issues to the public 2. leading campaign in states to uproot anti-union politicians at all levels; turning back efforts to enact right-to-work-for-less, paycheck deception laws; creating models of pro-worker governance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Political priority must be to promote, protect the right of workers to have a voice ■ Highest priority at local, state, national levels should be encouraging public officials to actively support workers trying to form unions, support maintenance, growth of union jobs ■ Public officials' track record on these issues should determine union members' support ■ Program must be fully aligned with organizing and growth program

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Substantive priorities <i>(continued)</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. building coalitions to roll back right-to-work laws 4. working with constituency groups to mobilize people of color 5. encouraging ballot initiatives that improve the lives of working people and bring them into electoral process 6. increasing efforts to recruit, train, elect union members to office 7. Build on success of Working America by expanding recruitment efforts and increasing membership to 2 million by end of 2006; enlisting support of Working America members electoral and legislative struggles, fights for corporate accountability 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Strategic objective should be to develop bipartisan coalition for worker rights, union job issues (e.g., preserving Davis Bacon) ■ Politicians who support union-busting agendas of business groups or other organizations should face rebuke, regardless of stand on other issues

CHANGING STATE AND LOCAL UNION MOVEMENTS

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Principles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ State and local movements are front line for legislative and political work, organizing, community alliances ■ Must strengthen their performance, provide them with adequate resources and hold them accountable so they can carry out programs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Does not discuss
Strategic planning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Lead strategic planning and budgeting to build adequately resourced, coordinated state efforts to move labor movement's program ■ Involve AFL-CIO, central bodies, national and local unions, constituency groups in this process 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Does not discuss
Accountability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Set enforceable performance benchmarks, standards for state and local labor movements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Does not discuss

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Increased participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Develop mechanisms to achieve full affiliation, funding, participation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Does not discuss
More effective structure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Reconfigure and decrease number of central labor councils to create large metro area and regional bodies with sufficient capacity, resources to carry out aggressive program 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Does not discuss
Achieving diversity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Expand leadership development efforts to ensure diversity 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Does not discuss

DIVERSITY		
	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Principles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Must expand leadership diversity and strengthen democracy; must create leadership paths for worker activists who will lead in renewal of labor movement 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ A strong, democratic labor movement embraces diversity; unions must reflect today's workforce in order to unite millions more workers, restore American Dream
Areas of diversity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Membership ■ Elected leaders ■ Staff ■ AFL-CIO conventions ■ State federations, central labor councils 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Membership ■ Elected leadership ■ Staff ■ Event speakers ■ Conventions and other decision-making bodies
Methods to achieve diversity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Increase training and leadership development ■ Accelerate efforts to recruit diverse pool of young people into union movement through Union Summer, public and media outreach 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Establish standards, timetables ■ Provide training opportunities

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Methods to achieve diversity <i>(continued)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Require representation of women, people of color at AFL-CIO credentialed conventions at least in proportion to membership in their union; urge affiliates to include young workers as delegates to conventions ■ Require Executive Council, state federations, central labor councils to develop plans to achieve diversity targets by 2009 Convention ■ Ask unions to sign onto "diversity principles" and report annually on representation of women, people of color in membership and leadership positions 	

AFL-CIO GOVERNANCE		
	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Principles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ To achieve successful, growing, unified movement, AFL-CIO governance must enrich affiliate decision-making, facilitate communication, mutual accountability 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ To become movement's growth center, AFL-CIO must change governance structure
Executive Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ 18 members plus AFL-CIO president ■ Largest 15 unions have permanent seats ■ Three unions appointed by AFL-CIO president for one-year terms to ensure broad representation ■ AFL-CIO secretary-treasurer, executive vice president are ex officio, nonvoting ■ Meet six times per year ■ Provide guidance on priority-setting, meeting overall goals, monitoring finances between Executive Council meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Largest unions have permanent seats ■ Several rotating seats to ensure diversity ■ Meet four times per year ■ Oversee strategic planning, budget approval, resource allocations, staffing

	AFL-CIO OFFICERS' PROPOSAL (April 28)	4-UNION PROPOSAL (May 16)
Executive Council	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Maintain current size ■ Meet four times per year (incl. three one-day meetings) ■ Emphasize discussions, decisions; staff reports distributed in advance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Does not discuss size ■ Meet two times per year ■ Does not address conduct of meetings
General Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Expand General Board to include four representatives of central labor councils, six representatives of constituency groups 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Does not discuss
Senior staff	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Monthly workgroup of senior staff appointed by each member of Executive Committee ■ Keeps committee members fully informed of major activities, pending decisions; helps set committee agenda 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Ongoing senior staff level meetings between unions on issues of AFL-CIO policy between meetings of principals